# IN THE MATTER OF A REVIEW PURSUANT TO SECTION 117(1) OF THE *POLICE ACT*, R.S.B.C. 1996, c.367

#### And

Re: CONSTABLE
SOUTH COAST BRITISH COLUMBIA
TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY
POLICE SERVICES

## NOTICE OF ADJUDICATOR'S DECISION

TO: Mr. (Complainant)

AND TO: Constable (Member)

South Coast British Columbia

Transportation Authority Police Service

AND TO: Acting Deputy Chief Officer J.B. MacDonald (Chief Officer)

South Coast British Columbia

Transportation Authority Police Service

AND TO: Mr. Stan T. Lowe

**B.C.** Police Complaint Commissioner

# <u>OUTLINE</u>

- A. BACKGROUND
- B. ALLEGATION
- C. ANALYSIS
- D. FINDINGS
- E. DECISION
- F. NOTICES

#### A. BACKGROUND

1. By Notice dated December 12, 2011, I was appointed by Stan T. Lowe, Police Complaint Commissioner (the PCC), to review a decision of Acting Deputy Chief Officer J.B. MacDonald (also Discipline Authority), South Coast British Columbia Transportation Authority Police Services (SCBCTAPS) who, after considering the Final Investigative Report of Staff Sergeant Doug Fisher (SCBCTAPS) (Professional Standards Unit), determined that "...the evidence did not appear to substantiate the following allegation against Constable

> That on February 27, 2010, it is alleged that Constable abused her authority by using foul or obscene language while interacting with the public. If proven the allegation would constitute misconduct pursuant to section 77(3)(a)(iii) of the Police Act.

2. Paragraph 2 of the Notice contains the following statement by the PCC:

> "I believe that there is a reasonable basis to believe the Discipline Authority was incorrect in determining that the conduct of Constable in relation to her profane, abusive or insulting language, did not constitute misconduct."

3. On December 13, 2011, I received a binder containing the following materials from the PCC:

Registered Complaint of received on February 17, 2011	,
Notice of Admissibility, dated Februa	ry 28, 2011
Notice of Complaint & Initiation of Invidated March 17, 2011	estigation,
Progress Reports:	
1 <sup>st</sup> Report dated May 4, 2011	5 <sup>th</sup> Report dated August 29, 2011

<sup>2&</sup>lt;sup>nd</sup> Report dated June 2, 2011 3<sup>rd</sup> Report dated June 30, 2011

<sup>4&</sup>lt;sup>th</sup> Report dated July 26, 2011

<sup>6&</sup>lt;sup>th</sup> Report dated September 27, 2011 7<sup>th</sup> Report dated October 25, 2011

	Request for Discontinuation re Sgt. Fred Thompson, dated May 16, 2011					
	Notice of Discontinuance re Sgt. Fred Thompson, dated June 7, 2011					
		t for Extension of In eptember 7, 2011 .				
	Notice o	f Extension, dated	September 16	3, 2011		
		vestigation Report ped on October 28, 2				
	NOTE:	The audio version attached thumbdri		owing intervie	ws is availa	able on the
		Cst Mr. Cst Cst Ms	, dated Ma	oril 11, 2011 30, 2011		
		ed Notice of Appoint ecember 12, 2011				
4.	The Co	mplaint in this ma	tter resulted	from a violent	t confrontation	on between
	individua	als from two groups	at the train s	tation at Maple	Ridge and is	s described,
	succinct	ly, in the Final Inves	stigative Repo	ort of Staff Serg	jeant Fisher (	(Fisher):
	Olympics Coast Ex having be seated no There are words wit	ximately 10:30 PM or the complainant, press with his girlfrie een downtown enjoyear the group tell this other group tell in. Beyond this exch	nd, ing the Olympi oup is another individuals or ling them to no	, is returning to , and an exte c events. The party of much the train. t use profanity a	Maple Ridge nded group of train is very o younger, drur has an round some of	on the West friends after crowded and aker, people. exchange of f the children
	the station are this and	e train gets into Maple party and the oth nd into the parking lo and another female. makes his way tow ed by two males from from behin several times in the	ner younger groot there is a very This results in vards Ms. the other groud and knocks	oup. As they all erbal and physic a pushing mate Before p, him to the grou	make their wall exchange in the can get and and male	ay out of the between Ms. witnesses there he is les now kick

injuries to Mr. It is a chaotic event with many people involved in the skirmishes. There is a CP Police officer, Constable alone on the platform, as the train is just now leaving with its compliment of Transit Police on board heading east. He signals a conductor to stop the train and summon the Transit police to come and help him. He enters the fray with as many as twenty individuals fighting around him. punched by a female and is bleeding as the Transit Police arrive. As the Transit Police arrive the group has disbursed the parking lot. CP Constable Transit Police Constable go after that group and check parties out on the street, away from the parking lot where Transit Police Constables are dealing with the parties and some other persons still fighting. As a consequence of this incident. ) submitted a formal Police Act complaint against Constable ) which, in part, is as follows: On February 27, 2010 you attended a fight in the parking lot at the West Coast Express Train Station in Maple Ridge. states the following: Upon regaining consciousness, I was greeted by Mr. About a meter away from Cst. there was a young man with no shirt on covered in my blood jumping up and down and yelling. He fled the scene when Cst. told him to stop shouting and sit down. For some reason neither Cst. or Cst. pursued the young man. Everyone in my group were frantically pleading with both officers to chase the young man, who had by then caught up to a large group of males about 100 yards away who were also fleeing the scene. I asked both officers why they weren't chasing after them, to which Cst. replied, screaming, "Don't fucking tell us how to do our jobs. Sit the fuck down, calm the fuck down, and shut the fuck up." After this I was angry and confused. I remember asking how they could just let them get away. Finally one of the officers radio'd for help and I believe the Railway Police, who just happened to be on scene as well apprehended the men. At this point, my brother-in-law ) pointed out to Cst. that there was a knife on the ground right beside where I had previously been lying unconscious. I asked if they could use it to help catch the guys who jumped me. At this point Cst. again began screaming at me "this isn't fucking C.S.I. I thought I told you to sit the fuck down and shut the fuck up." Cst. apologized for the way his partner was speaking to me and assured me that they would indeed finger print the knife and cross reference it with the prints of the suspects. He then checked me over to make sure I hadn't suffered any stab wounds (there was so much blood it was hard to tell). After checking me over, Cst. said that I needed to be checked over and an ambulance was called to the scene. At this point, I realized that two people in my party ( were in handcuffs. I asked why they were handcuffed and Cst. began to explain but was cut off by Cst. who was yet again screaming at me, "This is the last time I'm going to tell you to sit the fuck down and shut the fuck up." At this point I was fed up. I asked Cst. "what the fuck is your problem? I am the victim here. I wasn't looking for this. Fuck, I didn't even see it coming." At this point, Cst. again began shouting "listen, everyone here is drunk. We don't

5.

science." Cst.

know what the fuck happened. How do we know you're the victim? At this point, my

can you say that? Look at him for fuck sakes. Come on, it's not exactly rocket

), screamed back at Cst.

replied "Listen you little bitch calm down and shut the fuck

"how the hell

up." I couldn't believe what was happening. At this point, asked me for a cigarette. I asked Cst. if that would be ok. He said "sure" and I began walking towards to give him a smoke. Cst. again began shouting "if you take one more step, you're gonna be in fucking cuffs." I laughed out loud, frustrated, and asked Cst. if she really thought putting me in cuffs was going to make or break my evening. I walked to and gave him his smokes. Shortly after the ambulance arrived, Cst. greeted the two paramedics and they stood chatting and chuckling for about 15-20 minutes. Finally Cst. spoke up and said that I needed medical attention. After 5-10 more minutes a paramedic came to check me over. He had clearly been influenced by Cst. as he was very rude, condescending, rough and rude. At this point I said that I was going to take a cab to the hospital. I asked to go on record that I didn't feel safe travelling in their ambulance. While waiting for our taxi, I asked Cst. my statement. He seemed quite surprised by this request and said that I should go home, gather my thoughts, calm down and somebody from their office would call me the next day. I asked him for his badge # and file #. He seemed surprised by this also but reluctantly obliged. He gave me a card with the info and I took a cab to the hospital. I waited for a call from the Transit Police for seven days, and when I still hadn't received a call, I placed a call to them. I spoke to a female receptionist and gave my file #. She told me that neither of the officers were in the office until later in the day. I specifically requested not to receive a call from Cst. as she had been very rude and unprofessional. Later that day, in spite of my request, I received a call from Cst. It was a very frustrating conversation in which Cst. said many disturbing things.

- 1. There was "no evidence that a crime had been committed." I listed my injuries and she said that they didn't prove anything as "all evidence pointed to a drunken brawl." She said there were 17 people involved on the scene. I told her I was only in a group of 5 and asked what kind of fight would be 12 on 5. I reiterated that I never engaged anyone verbally or physically, and was attacked from behind. I told her to check my info and that I wasn't a violent person and had no criminal record.
- She said "You're actually not as squeaky clean as you claim." I asked what she was talking about to which she answered "Well, you had a 24 hr driving suspension in 2004." I asked what the hell that had to do with anything and she replied "It's a character thing."
- 3. When I asked her about the knife she quickly responded that she had no record of any weapon being found and that maybe I was confused as I had been drinking.
- 4. She said that the suspects were minors (which I now know to be a lie).
- 5. Unless I could identify them there was nothing the police could do. I asked why I had to ID them when they were caught on the scene and she said that they had claimed that I had attacked them. I asked if any of them had been injured or tried to follow up with her. She simply responded "No", and said again there was nothing she could do. Immediately after this call I contacted Victim Services and told them everything.

Some months passed by and I was still unable to return to work. I placed another call and asked to have a Staff Sgt. to return my call with an update. Sgt. of the Transit Police returned my call within a day or two.

Upon speaking to Sgt. by this department!

I was again very frustrated with the lack of action

He said that:

- a) There had been no assault investigation filed and
- b) That I was cleared medically on the scene and
- c) That there was no knife filed in evidence.

I explained my injuries and also the fact that I had already explained and described my injuries to Cst. one week after the crime. I also told Sgt. that I had photographs documenting my injuries. At this point Sgt. told me that unless I could find a third party witness there was really nothing he could do but would be happy to take my statement. I waited to contact him until I found a witness (

Since then, the officers have been much more diligent in their investigation. However, with the evidence I had it was hard for them to continue to do nothing.

It is important to mention that the treatment I have received from the Transit Police (until now) has been at times harder on me than the physical effects of the assault itself. I have lost faith in the policing system and the safety of society. The fact that I could have been, as a criminal record free, hard working, tax paying citizen, and innocent victim of a violent crime, put through all of this disrespect and attack of character. I look forward to hearing what is going to be done to right this horrible wrong.

#### **B.** ALLEGATION

#### 6. Abuse Of Authority

That on February 27, 2010, it is alleged that Constable abused her authority by using foul or obscene language while interacting with the public. If proven the allegation would constitute misconduct pursuant to section 77(3)(a)(iii) of the *Police Act*.

# C. ANALYSIS

- 7. Fisher interviewed and (all members of the SCBCTAPS), and conversed on the telephone with( ) who was considered to be an independent witness.
- 8. All interviews were recorded and transcribed.

- 9. I have read all transcribed interviews but did not find it necessary to listen to sound recordings of those interviews.
- 10. My decision in this matter rests with my evaluation of the information provided in the Duty Reports and interviews of and and the interviews of and I will comment on the information provided by each of those individuals.

# 1. Constable

- 11. A fair summary, in my judgment, of information is as follows:
  - At the time of her response to the scene of the confrontation, she was "burnt out" and "tired." (interview lines 25,26)
  - Her "adrenalin level was high, my heart rate was up and my mind was racing." (interview lines 84,85)
  - She was scared and had "never been part of a fight this big before." (interview line 25)
  - She does not recall any conversation with "There was a possibility she did but it would have been brief." (interview lines 189, 190)
  - She does not recall using any profane language directed towards but stated "At some point in time, I will confess that I have told people to shut the fuck up and sit the fuck down or something terrible is going to happen to you." (interview lines 444 to 447)

# 2. Constable

- 12. I summarize information as follows:
  - He had received and read a copy of Complaint Form filed against and also a copy of the Notice of Complaint and Initiation of Investigation Document.
  - When asked by Fisher if he heard swearing at he replied: "I do not recall any specific shouting from her." (interview lines 329, 330)

- When asked by Fisher "Did you hear tell him to "Sit the fuck down," he replied: "I might have heard her say something similar to myself. I've read his allegation." N (interview lines 361, 362)
- He observed and who he believed was girlfriend speaking to two Ridge Meadows RCMP members and overheard "exclaiming something about how he was being treated." (Duty Report, par. 12)

## 3. Constable

- 13. I summarize information as follows:
  - She was in no proximity to hear any conversations that may have occurred between or anyone at the Maple Meadows Station.
  - Although in the proximity of and she does not remember "any unprofessional language being used or any inappropriate behaviour occurring from either one of them." (interview lines 98 to 102)
  - When asked by Fisher if she remembered swearing at somebody she replied: "I don't remember her swearing at anyone." (interview line 186)

4.

14. heard a verbal exchange between a female officer and but is unable to recall anything that was said.

5.

15. I will comment on information in my concluding observations.

# D. <u>FINDINGS</u>

16. I can find no reason to conclude that concocted his complaint about use of abusive and profane language towards him. Also, there is no information as to complaining of the manner in which other officers conducted themselves, verbally, in the course of the investigation.

- 17. 2. I find, as being reliable information, the following:
  - statement, taken, in part, from his Complaint Form and the Notice of Complaint and Initiation of Investigation document:

"Upon regaining consciousness I was greeted by Cst. About a meter away from Cst. there was a young man with no shirt on covered in my blood jumping up and down and velling. He fled the scene when Cst. told him to stop shouting and sit down. For some reason neither Cst. or Cst. pursued the young man. Everyone on my group were frantically pleading with both officers to chase the young man, who had by then caught up to a large group of males about 100 yards away who were also fleeing the scene. I asked both officers why they weren't chasing after them, to which Cst. replied, screaming, "Don't fucking tell us how to do our jobs. Sit the fuck down, calm the fuck down, and shut the fuck up." After this I was angry and confused. I remember asking how they could just let them get away. Finally one of the officers radio'd for help and I believe the Railway Police, who just happened to be on scene as well apprehended the men. At this point, my brother-in-law ( ) pointed out to Cst. that there was a knife on the ground right beside where I had previously been lying unconscious. I asked if they could use it to help catch the guys who jumped me. At this point, Cst. again began screaming at me "this isn't fucking C.S.I. I thought I told you to sit the fuck down and shut the fuck up."

statement, taken, in part, from his Complaint Form and the Notice of Complaint and Initiation of Investigation Document:

"Cst. apologized for the way his partner was speaking to me and assured me that they would indeed finger print the knife and cross reference it with the prints of the suspects."

statements, taken, in part, from his Duty Report dated 2011-03-21 and his interview with Fisher on 2011-04-11:

"Two Ridge Meadows RCMP members were speaking to Mr. and I believe his fiancée, as well. I overheard Mr. explaining something about how he was being treated, to which the RCMP member said something similar to, 'Until we figure out what is going on, everyone is a suspect."

18. 3. I find, as being unreliable information, statements in answers to questions from Fisher in her interview on 2011-04-19:

#### Lines 428 to 435

FISHER: "And he alleges that you screamed at him, "Don't fucking tell us how to do our job. Shut the fuck down, calm the fuck down and shut the fuck up." Do you remember saying that to him?

No.

FISHER: Do you remember telling him anything?

I don't – don't remember any contact with him."

#### Lines 450 to 472

FISHER: "So I'll ask you again: Is there a possibility you might have told Mr. to sit the fuck down?

If I had told Mr. to sit the fuck down, I would remember telling Mr. to sit the fuck down. I'd remember. I understand that we do things in the heat. I told to stay the fuck down. I remember that. I remember my interaction with her.

FISHER: So you -

If I - if I had interacted with -

FISHER: -- you remember having an interaction with -Yes.

FISHER: -- that could have mistook for being related in his direction? I'm only – I'm supposing he could have.

I don't recall having contact with so I don't – and I would remember telling him. I would remember telling him, speaking to him that way.

FISHER: Okay.

And I don't remember having any contact with him or saying those things to him.

#### Lines 473 to 494

FISHER: Okay. And he relates, pointing out a knife to Constable and he relates that he asked Constable if he was going to seize it. And at that point in time, Constable again began screaming at me – quote – "This isn't fucking CSI. I thought I had told you to sit the fuck down and shut the fuck up." Again –

That's not something I would say and I did not say that. I don't – FISHER: Okay.

-- remember getting any - I don't even remember a knife on scene. Don't remember anything about a knife. I never saw a knife. I don't remember anything about a knife.

19. It is noted that fiancé, , and his brother-in-law, were not, apparently, contacted by Fisher. Also, it appears that Members of the Ridge Meadows RCMP Detachment were not contacted to provide any information pertaining to their conversation with about the way he had been treated—a conversation which was observed, overheard and recalled by in his Duty Report and his interview with Fisher and which took place while was at the scene.

# E. <u>DECISION</u>

- 20. I have determined (applying the onus of proof as being on the balance of probabilities) that it appears that on February 27, 2010, Constable abused her authority by using foul or obscene language while interacting with the public and that, if proven, the allegation would constitute misconduct pursuant to section 77(3)(a)(iii) of the Police Act.
- 21. In accordance with section 117(8)(d) of the *Police Act*, I direct that a Prehearing Conference be offered to Constable
- 22. The disciplinary measure being considered is a reprimand.

December 23, 2011	
Date	Hon. H. Benjamin Casson, Q.C.,
	Adjudicator and Discipline Authority

#### F. NOTICES

23. In accordance with section 119 of the *Police Act*, Constable has the right to request permission to call, examine or cross-examine witnesses

at the discipline proceeding. Such a request must be in writing and submitted within 10 business days following receipt of the Notice of Decision.

24. The Complainant, , is hereby given notice that, pursuant to section 113 (1) of the *Police Act*, he has the right to make submissions, oral or written, with respect to the complaint; the adequacy of the investigation; and the disciplinary or corrective measures that would be appropriate.

"Hon. H. Benjamin Casson, Q.C."
Hon. H. Benjamin Casson, Q.C.,
Adjudicator and Discipline Authority